

THE WEST COAST REGIONAL COUNCIL

MINUTES OF THE ANNUAL MEETING OF THE PUNAKAIKI RATING DISTRICT HELD AT THE KEATING RESIDENCE ON 2 NOVEMBER 2016, COMMENCING AT 7.05 PM.

PRESENT

M & F. Keating, J. Lightfoot, C. King, G & A. Beynon, T. Sullivan, A. Palmer, T. Wilkins, C. Findlay, M. Wilkins, Martina, T. Pugno (arrived 7.12), D & G. Freeman, A. Chapman, J & M. Costello, T. Wyndham-Smith, J. Gerard, S. Gasson.

IN ATTENDANCE

West Coast Regional Council

T. Archer (Councillor), N. Clementson (Councillor), Mayor Howard (Buller District Council)
R. Beal, P. Birchfield, T Jellyman (Staff)

APOLOGIES

G & J. Friend, S. Casey, P. Grant, B. Smith, I & L. Ryder

Moved: *"That the apologies be accepted."*

J. Lightfoot / M. Keating - Carried

BUSINESS

T. Wyndham-Smith advised that she is representing the Westport News, she is a Punakaiki resident but not a member of this rating district.

Cr Clementson opened the meeting and welcomed those present to the meeting.
He introduced himself and the Council staff.

Moved: *"That the minutes of the previous Annual Meeting held on 29 October 2015, be adopted as a true and correct record of that meeting."*

C. Findlay / A. Palmer - Carried

MATTERS ARISING

There were no matters arising.

FINANCIAL REPORT

R. Beal presented the financial statements for the financial period ending 30 June 2016. He drew attention to an error in the report, and advised that the \$45,000 is from rates, not interest. R. Beal reported that the opening balance in the maintenance account is \$63,708.34 in deficit and the closing balance as at 30 June 2016 is \$109,565.59 in deficit. M. Meehan advised that as of today the current balance is now \$124,000 in deficit. It was noted that there is a \$90 difference in the contractor's fees. M. Meehan stated that it is pleasing to see that the loan account is now paid off.

WORKS REPORT

P. Birchfield presented the 2015 / 2016 works report and advised that \$64,895.20 worth of works were completed during the reporting period, along with \$4006.40 worth of survey work. \$9,460 was spent on work completed by consultants. P. Birchfield advised that quarry waste from Eight Mile was used to top up the running surface for the emergency works that were done at the south end of

the existing wall. She stated this held in a lot better than previous material used. Work was also done around the north end of the seawall following erosion that occurred in February / March. P. Birchfield carried out an inspection in July 2016 and identified two areas that required immediate maintenance works. She reported that this work was completed in August by MBD Contracting Ltd. Some slumping was repaired at the south end at this time also. P. Birchfield has allowed \$60,000 for unforeseen maintenance over the 2016 / 2017 period. A. Palmer stated that a lot of topping up is done on the seawall; he asked if this is the same for other seawalls in the region. P. Birchfield stated that advised that the only comparable seawall is the Hokitika seawall. M. Meehan advised that the Hokitika seawall is not a fair comparison as it is new, sand is currently building up in this area, but the area is going through a 20 year erosion cycle. M. Meehan explained the Okuru seawall has the river mouth going out, there is a sand spit that protects the seawall and there has not been any pressure on this seawall. M. Meehan agreed that the maintenance costs on the Punakaiki seawall is high with coastal dynamics adding to the high costs. Mayor Howard spoke of the coastal erosion currently being experienced around the Westport Airport. A. Chapman asked when NZTA would contribute to maintenance. M. Meehan responded that this would not happen until the state highway was affected.

RATES 2017 / 2018

Cr Clementson advised that the recommended maintenance rate is set at \$95,000 for the coming financial year. M. Meehan advised the Council has combined the \$50,000 that was being paid for the loan with the maintenance rate of \$45,000. M. Meehan suggested that the meeting considers what is to be done about the northern extension, a proposal has been put to the rating district and emergency works have also been done in this area. He stated that the \$95,000 is based on what is currently in place. M. Meehan advised that the maintenance rate is a recommendation which goes back to Council and then goes into next year's Annual Plan. M. Meehan advised that several rounds of consultation on whether or not to progress the northern extension have been carried out with feedback being provided back to the rating district. M. Meehan stated that the survey results were quite mixed with around 50 / 50 responses for both the classifications of the rating districts and whether or not to proceed with the work. He noted that the last results with the revised rating classifications and costings revealed 13 in favour of proceeding and nine voting not to proceed. M. Meehan stated that going forward, Council has an estimate on costs, and Council would now like to tender out the work and report back to the rating district with a firm price. M. Meehan advised that the same principles for the consultation process for the northern extension have been used as those that were used for this seawall. He stated that the principles are that there are people that are not directly protected by the current wall that did contribute to the existing wall and this is why a heavy weighting was put on the campground as a direct benefactor and it was also acknowledged that the campground was contributor to the original seawall. M. Meehan advised that it is not just the camping ground and other businesses affected. He noted that if these properties were to leave then there is potential for the sea to get behind this area and affect other private properties directly behind the current wall. M. Meehan stated that Council's rating expert weighted the costings very heavily on the campground for this reason. M. Meehan answered questions from speakers. Extensive discussion took place including funding options, tourism opportunities, coastal erosion and managed retreat options. Cr Archer stated that the information contained in coastal hazard reports over the last year or two have all recommended that coastal communities that are subject to the threat of potential erosion, they should be starting for a planned withdrawal. Cr Archer stated that the advice advises that short and medium term protection works can be done but the reality is that communities need to start planning for withdrawal. He stated that Ngakawau and Granity are in the same situation. Cr Archer stated that he understands that maintenance costs are getting higher and higher. He added that Councils are inferred under statute that they need to provide a level of protection for communities. He stated that Council's look at the individual issues that each community faces, expert reports are obtained and in every case the benefiting parties has met the costs of this. Cr Archer stated that experts are saying that coastal erosion is going to get worse. A. Palmer agreed that this is the reality and that the rating district should have a plan that tells people what their options are, whether there is another option to move houses or do they wait until there is

a crisis. M. Meehan stated that this rating district has a lot at stake as they have put a lot of work in to date and there are difficult decisions to make. M. Meehan advised that cost benefits for carrying on need to be looked at along with maintenance costs. He advised that recent survey results reveal that the beach has built up but a big storm could change this. A. Palmer stated that he would not like to see the community put hundreds of thousands of dollars into something that is just buying time on fairly short term basis. He stated that this money could be better spent establishing a new community if ultimately that is what is going to be required. Cr Archer stated that nobody knows when this is going to happen. A. Palmer agreed with this and stated that if a subdivision is made available then people can decide if they want to move and as people move they are no longer in the rating district and are no longer paying for a seawall. He stated that he would like to have an option that he could rationally consider. Discussion took place on possible sites where residential properties could be relocated to. Mayor Howard advised that there is land available for this purpose. M. Meehan stated that good points have been made around the long term plan, but there is not a successful example anywhere in the country where a managed retreat has been done well. M. Meehan advised that if climate change predictions are correct there will be a lot of places around the country that will be affected. M. Meehan spoke of the cost benefit analysis work that is currently being done in Franz Josef. Cr Archer asked the meeting for a general consensus on the option for a managed retreat. M. Meehan advised that Council managed to get funding assistance through four ministries for this type of work for Franz Josef and it could be possible to get similar funding for this rating district. He stated that Franz Josef and Punakaiki have been identified through the Growth Study as significant areas for tourism. Extensive discussion took place on the option of a managed retreat. C. Findlay spoke of the impact this could have on property values.

M. Meehan asked the meeting what they would like to do regarding the northern extension of the seawall. He suggested that the work is tendered out, and the tender price and costings is then provided to the rating district. Discussion took place on the possibility of extending the rating district as T. Pugno feels that with only 26 ratepayers paying in, it is not fair and he would like the rating district extended as it is very expensive. T. Sullivan expressed his concern that if the northern extension work is not done, and the seawall fails, then that could cause further damage. T. Sullivan asked that if a decision isn't made tonight on whether or not to go ahead with the northern extension, what Council's mandate is. M. Meehan stated that he is suggesting the next step is for Council to tender out the work, get the costings, and then re-consult with the community so that an informed decision can be made. All present agreed with this.

F. Keating stated that she is very unhappy with the A, B, C, D and E classifications that were recently sent out. M. Meehan advised that as part of the work, the rating classifications can be re-looked at to make it as fair as possible. M. Meehan advised that in the next mail out, people will receive the defined costs of the work, implications for each property, and two maps. G. Beynon asked if a flat maintenance rate for everyone could be considered. M. Meehan stated that Council is looking for a fair and affordable way forward. Cr Clementson stated that this is a very dynamic coastline and it is difficult to forecast what is going to happen in the future. Various suggestions were made on how to manage the seawall. M. Keating stated that a decision needs to be made on what the maintenance rate is going to be.

Moved: *"That the rate strike for the Punakaiki rating district is \$95,000 for the 2017 / 2018 financial year."*

G. Beynon / C. Findlay - Carried

P. Birchfield advised that Peter Grant has asked her to raise the option of putting in bollards on Dickinson Parade between Webb and Mabel Streets to stop people from driving along this area. P. Birchfield stated that the bollards would be able to be moved when necessary to allow for access to the area as required. A. Palmer stated this was discussed last year and it was voted down. Mayor Howard advised that this has become a health & safety issue and Buller District Council's Operations department are currently looking closely at this.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Cr Clementson read out the names of those on the committee. He asked if anyone wishes to either come off or stand down from the committee or if anyone present would like to be elected onto the committee. It was agreed that the existing members of the status quo would remain.

Moved: ***"That the existing members, G. Beynon, T. Wilkins, S. Casey, M. Keating, A. Beynon, I. Ryder, L. Totzauer, T. Sullivan, C. Findlay and J. Lightfoot remain on the committee for 2016 / 2017 financial year".***

J. Costello / J. Lightfoot – Carried

Cr Clementson called for nominations for spokesperson. A. Palmer nominated C. Findlay. F. Keating seconded the nomination. T. O'Sullivan nominated G. Beynon as deputy spokesperson. J. Lightfoot seconded this nomination.

Moved: ***"That the C. Findlay be elected as the Spokesperson for the 2016 / 2017 financial year and G. Beynon be the deputy Spokesperson".***

A. Palmer / F. Keating – Carried

GENERAL BUSINESS

M. Keating asked what is the purpose of the red pegs near Hadder's Beach. He asked if there is going to be more rock available in this area and if it is likely that this area will be blasted. P. Birchfield stated that she is keeping a careful eye on this area and has "dib's" on the rock.

Cr Clementson and J. Lightfoot passed on their thanks to M & F. Keating for hosting the meeting at their home. T. O'Sullivan expressed his appreciation to Councillors and all present for their input into the meeting. A. Beynon thanked Mayor Howard for his input. Mayor Howard stated that he will ensure that Buller District Councillors are in attendance at future meetings. Cr Clementson thanked those present for their contributions to tonight's meeting.

There being no further business the meeting closed at 8.20 p.m.

Action Points:

- R. Beal and P. Birchfield to work on costs and tendering of work for the northern extension and send this out to the rating district.