#### THE WEST COAST REGIONAL COUNCIL

### **LOWER WAIHO RATING DISTRICT**

# Minutes of a Committee Meeting held on the Rubbish Dump Stopbank

# On Tuesday 19 November 2013, commencing at 11.15am

#### Present

Richard Molloy (Spokesperson), Chris Brookes, Neil Frendrup, Robin Richards, Lorraine Richards, Leigh Frendrup, Peter Halford.

Wayne Moen (Staff)

### **Apologies**

Wayne Moen tendered an apology from Council's Planning Manager Mike Meehan

# **Business**

# A. Rubbish Dump Stopbank Upgrade

Richard opened the meeting and asked Wayne for an update on developments to date.

Wayne explained that, at the ratepayers' request from the last Annual meeting held in September 2013, he had prepared a contract for the raising and strengthening of the existing Rubbish Dump stopbank. He outlined the current situation where the existing stopbank had been overtopped on at least 3 occasions this year and that the proposed re-strengthening works had become very urgent.

He pointed out that 4 tenders had been received and the prices were:

\$97,590.00,

\$99,325.00

\$205,400.00

\$231,786.60

(All figures being GST Exclusive)

Neil asked why the range between the two highest and two lowest tenderers was so great.

Wayne explained that this was normal and that the pricing was done by individuals within the appropriate contracting firms and said that the two lowest prices were very low reflecting 1980's prices.

He stated that the successful contractor was Henry Adams Contracting Ltd and that they were preparing to start the raising of the Rubbish Dump stopbank this week.

The surveyors would be setting out the extent of works later in the week.

Wayne also outlined the financial implications if not all of the estimated 5,000 tonnes could not be sourced locally from the Waiho Loop area and pointed out that if any rock had to be sourced from the Whataroa Quarry the estimated costs would escalate.

He estimated that if 3,000 tonnes was locally sourced and 2,000 tonnes had to be sourced from Whataroa, that the estimated cost of the job would increase from approximately \$144,000 to \$170,000 (GST Exclusive).

Neil asked how the work was to be funded.

Wayne replied that the Council would take out a loan on behalf of the Lower Rating District and ratepayers would pay the loan off over a period to be agreed by the Committee.

Chris felt that such a decision should be made by all ratepayers.

Peter pointed out that the committee had been voted on to represent the ratepayers and to make such decisions on their behalf.

Discussion took place on the design and amounts of material in the Rubbish Dump stopbank.

Wayne answered all queries on this issue.

Richard pointed out that as the Rubbish Dump stopbank was going ahead that a decision had to be made by the committee, on whether to proceed with the proposed Rubbish Dump stopbank to Rata Knoll, or not.

# B Rubbish Dump to Rata Knoll Stopbank

Robin Richards said that from his experience, it was essential that this work proceed given the very cheap price tended by Henry Adams Contracting Ltd at a price of \$90,890.00 (GST Exclusive).

He explained the importance of maintaining the road access to the Waiho Flat area and made the comment that if the road access was cut it would impact extremely on all downstream landowners and farmers alike.

Leigh Frendrup disagreed, saying that the government would come to the rescue with funds.

Richard pointed out that if the ratepayers were shown to have ignored protection advice, that the Government and insurance companies would not be interested. This was reinforced by Peter .

Neil asked if ratepayers could pay a lump sum as their share.

Chris and Lorraine felt that a lot of ratepayers could not afford a one-off payment and Lorraine felt that the payment should be inter-generational.

Wayne also explained that from the Rating Powers Act perspective, it would have to be one or the other, not a combination of the two types of payment.

Wayne explained that as a general rule, from his experience, that property values would increase as a result of flood protection works.

He also explained that the proposed link bank would not be initially rock protected and that if the gravel bank was breached at some future date, it would be a reasonably easy job to reinstate the gravel breach. He did not see the complete failure of such a wall as there was some limited protection from the existing Rubbish Dump stopbank.

Leigh asked why there had been no proposal to extend the Milton and Others stopbank downstream.

Richard Molloy stated that the issue had not been raised in the past.

Peter said that there was no reason why such a proposal could not be discussed at future rating district meetings.

Lorraine felt that the present natural rock armouring on Rata Knoll should not be disturbed.

Peter asked about the proposed loan.

Wayne supplied the loan proposals based on a loan of \$260,000 (GST Exclusive) and showed the different annual payments for a 5, 10 and 20 year repayment period.

Richard asked that the following motion be voted on

Moved:

That the proposed link bank between the Rubbish Dump bank and Rata Knoll is constructed by the successful contractor at the submitted price of \$90,890 (GST Exclusive) and that the Council implement /organise a loan for \$260,000 (GST Exclusive) over a 10 year period at the best interest rates obtainable.

R. Molloy / P.Halford

In Favour: R. Molloy, P. Halford, R. Richards, L. Richards

Against: C. Brookes, N. Frendrup, L. Frendrup

The motion was carried by a majority of 4:3.

Richard advised, as Spokesperson, that the majority voted in favour of the Rubbish Dump to Rata Knoll stopbank extension and that it proceed immediately after the Rubbish Dump upgrade.

The meeting concluded at 12.15 pm.

Wayne Moen

Engineer

20 November 2013